

## **COST OF CAPITAL STUDY**

### YIELD CAPITALIZATION

2017 Assessment Year

APPENDIX C

### **Power Industry**

QUITY RATE						10.00%	
CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL	-						PAGE
CAPM Ex Ante			7.40%				4
DIVIDEND GROWTH MODELS							
Value Line, based on Dividend	s Growth		10.00%				6
Value Line, based on Earnings	Growth		10.00%				7
Value Line, based on Return o	n Equity		7.50%				8
					RANGE	7.40-10.00%	
DEBT RATE						5.60%	9
DEBT RATE MARKET CAPITAL STRUCTURE						5.60%	9
	45%	x	10.00%	=		<b>5.60%</b> 4.50%	9
MARKET CAPITAL STRUCTURE		x x	10.00% 5.60%		3.08%		

### WEIGHTED AVERAGE COST OF CAPITAL

6.41%

### SUPPORT FOR GUIDELINE COMPANIES

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

											Capital c	
Company	Ticker	Beta	Fin'l Strength	P/E Ratio	Div'd Yield	Common Stock	%	Preferred Stock	%	Long Term Debt	%	Total Debt & Equity
AES Corp	aes	1.15	В	nmf	4.8%	2,794,933,168	12.7%			19,160,000,000	87.3%	21,954,933,168
Calpine Corp	cpn	1.00	B+	41.4	nil	3,267,462,052	22.2%			11,431,000,000	77.8%	14,698,462,052
Dominion Resources Inc	D	0.70	B++	21.0	3.7%	14,603,285,695	33.7%			28,707,000,000	66.3%	43,310,285,695
Duke Energy	duk	0.60	А	18.6	4.3%	40,440,858,536	47.9%			43,964,000,000	52.1%	84,404,858,536
Dynegy Inc	dyn	1.40	C+	nmf	0.0%	1,642,208,652	15.2%	400,000,000	3.7%	8,778,000,000	81.1%	10,820,208,652
El Paso Electric	ee	0.70	B++	20.4	2.6%	1,059,656,733	47.0%			1,195,400,000	53.0%	2,255,056,733
Entergy Corp	etr	0.65	B++	10.9	4.7%	8,094,288,774	35.5%	203,200,000	0.9%	14,492,000,000	63.6%	22,789,488,774
Exelon Corp	exc	0.70	B++	20.0	3.6%	25,759,241,761	43.9%			32,972,000,000	56.1%	58,731,241,761
NextEra Energy	nee	0.65	А	21.4	2.9%	23,597,032,839	45.6%			28,195,000,000	54.4%	51,792,032,839
NRG Energy	nrg	1.25	B+	nmf	2.0%	4,447,732,355	19.5%	298,000,000	1.3%	18,006,000,000	79.1%	22,751,732,355
Pattern Energy	pegi	1.25	B+	nmf	8.2%	987,736,277	42.5%			1,335,000,000	57.5%	2,322,736,277
Sempra Energy	sre	0.80	А	25.7	3.0%	12,353,012,066	47.7%	20,000,000	0.1%	13,522,000,000	52.2%	25,895,012,066
Southern Co	SO	0.55	А	16.7	4.4%	28,027,985,128	39.4%	1,508,000,000	2.1%	41,550,000,000	58.5%	71,085,985,128
TransAlta Corp	tac	0.85	C++	17.4	2.9%	2,406,736,490	34.9%	771,000,000	11.2%	3,722,000,000	53.9%	6,899,736,490
Mean		0.88		21.4	3.6%	12,105,869,323	34.8%		3.2%	19,073,528,571	63.8%	
Harmonic Mean		0.80					28.9%		0.4%		61.8%	
Weighted Mean						169,482,170,526	38.5%	3,200,200,000	0.7%	267,029,400,000	60.7%	439,711,770,526
Median		0.75			3.6%		37.5%		1.7%		58.0%	

Capital Structure at Book Value

# SUPPORT FOR CAPITAL STRUCTURE Market Value

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

Company	Ticker	Stock Price	Common Shares	Common Stock	%	Preferred Stock	%	Long Term Debt	%	Total Debt & Equity
AES Corp	aes	11.620	659,182,351	7,659,698,919	26.6%	-		21,087,000,000	73.4%	28,746,698,919
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.430	359,061,764	4,104,075,963	25.4%	-		12,046,000,000	74.6%	16,150,075,963
Dominion Resource	D	76.590	626,750,459	48,002,817,655	58.8%	-		33,584,000,000	41.2%	81,586,817,655
Duke Energy	duk	77.620	688,941,372	53,475,629,295	52.1%	-		49,161,000,000	47.9%	102,636,629,295
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.460	117,300,618	992,363,228	9.4%	400,000,000	3.8%	9,203,000,000	86.9%	10,595,363,228
El Paso Electric	ee	46.500	40,522,246	1,884,284,439	57.1%	-		1,417,958,000	42.9%	3,302,242,439
Entergy Corp	etr	73.470	179,394,698	13,180,128,462	47.3%	203,200,000	0.7%	14,467,655,000	51.9%	27,850,983,462
Exelon Corp	exc	35.490	923,270,314	32,766,863,444	48.5%	-		34,813,000,000	51.5%	67,579,863,444
NextEra Energy	nee	119.460	467,267,977	55,819,832,532	63.8%	-		31,623,000,000	36.2%	87,442,832,532
NRG Energy	nrg	12.260	315,442,011	3,867,319,055	17.0%	298,000,000	1.3%	18,600,000,000	81.7%	22,765,319,055
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.990	87,410,290	1,659,921,407	54.2%	-		1,400,000,000	45.8%	3,059,921,407
Sempra Energy	sre	100.640	250,060,973	25,166,136,323	60.9%	20,000,000	0.0%	16,122,000,000	39.0%	41,308,136,323
Southern Co	so	50.760	979,999,480	49,744,773,605	51.0%	1,508,000,000	1.5%	46,286,000,000	47.5%	97,538,773,605
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.500	288,231,915	1,585,275,533	23.9%	771,000,000	11.6%	4,271,000,000	64.4%	6,627,275,533
			Mean		42.6%		3.2%		56.1%	
			Harmonic Mean		31.1%		0.3%		51.9%	
			Weighted Mean	299,909,119,858	50.2%	3,200,200,000	0.5%	294,081,613,000	49.2%	597,190,932,858
			Median		49.7%		1.4%		49.7%	
			Std Dev		18.1%		4.3%		16.8%	
		Coeff	icient of Variation		42.6%		136.5%		30.0%	
			Target		45%				55%	100%

# SUPPORT FOR YIELD CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT CAPITAL ASSET PRICING MODEL

2017 Assessment Year

Ex Ante

			Ke = Rf	+ B (Rp)		
Ke =	Cost of Equity					7.40%
						to page 1
		Rm =	rate of return	8.50%		
		Rf =	risk free rate	3.00%		
		Rp =	risk premium	5.50%		_
		B =	Beta	0.80		page 7
p =	Risk Premium					5.50%
						to above
	Shannon Pratt and	Roger Grab	owski		3.50% - 6.00%	
		Cost of Ca	pital, Applications and Exan	ples, 3rd Ed, 2008		
	Dr. Aswath Damoda				5.69%	chart page 13
			s.stern.nyu.edu/~adamodar	/	5.14%	adjusted for Rf
	Jahr Oncham 0.044		ed Premium		F 700/	10
	John Graham & Car			10	5.70%	10 year expected real ret
	Duke CFO magazine	4th Qtr 201	Isiness Outlook survey - L	.5.	2.23% 4.93%	Rf rate used in survey adjusted for Rf
		411 Q11 201			4.3376	
f =	Risk Free Rate					3.00%
	2016 Valuation Han	dbook				to above
	as of 12-30-16	Long Terr	n (20 years) US Treasur	y Bond Yield	2.79%	
	Malua Lin		Only start Vial 1	0017 0107		
	as of 12-28-16		Selected Yields January	o, 2017, page 3197		
	ao 01 12-20-10	UU HEASU	ry Securities year end data	ear	2.00%	
				year	2.51%	
				vear	3.09%	
				year Zero	3.17%	
				,	•••••	
		atistical Re	ease (http://www.federal	reserve.gov/Releases/	H15/Current/)	
	as of 12-30-16		Treasury Constant Ma	turities		
			5 y	ear	1.93%	
			10	year	2.45%	
			20	year	2.79%	
				year	3.06%	
			00	URBER TIDO	0 0 0 0/	
				year TIPS	0.82%	1.97%
				year TIPS	0.99%	1.97% 2.07%
				-		
flatio	on			-		2.07%
nflatio	-	ent Survey.	30	year TIPS		2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flati	-		30 Economic Series January	year TIPS 6, 2017, page 1500		2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flatio	-		30	year TIPS 6, 2017, page 1500	0.99%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flatio	-	Consumer	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of	year TIPS 6, 2017, page 1500	0.99%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flati	Value Line Investme	Consumer	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of	year TIPS <b>6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021	0.99%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flati	Value Line Investme	Consumer Ink of Phila The Living	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia	year TIPS <b>6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016	0.99% 2.50%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication
flatio	Value Line Investme	Consumer Ink of Phila The Living Inflation me	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 20	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba	Consumer Ink of Philae The Livings Inflation me https://www	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 20 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00%
	Value Line Investme	Consumer Ink of Philae The Livings Inflation me https://www	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 20 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic	Consumer ank of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www Product (	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 20 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic	Consumer ank of Phila The Living: Inflation monopole https://www Projected	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 2d edian (measured by the CPI philadelphiafed.org/research	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30%	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic	Consumer ank of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www Projected Median Pro	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 2d edian (measured by the CPI philadelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP (	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years <b>and-data/real-time-cente</b> <b>Growth</b> , 2016 Report	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% ar/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve	Consumer ank of Phila The Living Inflation me https://www. Projected Median Pro http://www.fil	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 21 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( bjection Value From Dec 14 rederalreserve.gov/monetary	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 D16 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente <b>Growth</b> , 2016 Report iolicy/fornccalendars.htm	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% ar/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve	Consumer ank of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www Projected Median Pro http://www.i udget Offi	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 21 edian (measured by the CPI uphiladelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( Djection Value From Dec 14 rederalreserve.gov/monetaryp ice Real GDP Economi	year TIPS 7 6, 2017, page 1500 Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth , 2016 Report iolicy/fomccalendars.htm c Projections	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve	Consumer ank of Phila The Living: Inflation mo- https://www. Projected Median Pro- http://www.fi udget Offf The Budge	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 21 edian (measured by the CPI uphiladelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( ojection Value From Dec 14 iederalreserve.gov/monetaryp ice Real GDP Economi t and Economic Outlook 20	year TIPS 7 6, 2017, page 1500 Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth , 2016 Report Iolicy/fomccalendars.htm c Projections 17-2027	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126 1.86%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve	Consumer Ink of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www Projectee Median Pro http://www.1 udget Offf The Budge Average Pr	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 21 edian (measured by the CPI uphiladelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( Djection Value From Dec 14 rederalreserve.gov/monetaryp ice Real GDP Economi	year TIPS 7 6, 2017, page 1500 Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth , 2016 Report Iolicy/fomccalendars.htm c Projections 17-2027	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126
	Value Line Investm Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve Congressional Ba	Consumer Ink of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www. Projectee Median Pro- http://www.f Udget Offf The Budge Average P. http://www.f	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 24 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( bjection Value From Dec 14 ederalreserve.gov/monetary ice Real GDP Economi t and Economic Outlook 20 ercentage Change From Ye cbo.gov/publication/51129	year TIPS 7 6, 2017, page 1500 Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth , 2016 Report Iolicy/fomccalendars.htm c Projections 17-2027	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126 1.86%
	Value Line Investme Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve	Consumer ink of Phila The Living Inflation me https://www. Product ( Projected Median Pro http://www.f Udget Offf The Budge Average Pe http://www.f Bank of F	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 2/ edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( bjection Value From Dec 14 iederalreserve.gov/monetaryp ice Real GDP Economi t and Economic Outlook 20 ercentage Change From Ye bbo.gov/publication/51129 Philadelphia	year TIPS <b>7 6, 2017, page 1500</b> Change 2019-2021 D16 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente <b>Growth</b> , 2016 Report iolicy/fomccalendars.htm <b>c Projections</b> 17-2027 ar to Year	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126 1.86% 1.90%
	Value Line Investm Federal Reserve Ba nal Gross Domestic Federal Reserve Congressional Ba	Consumer Ink of Phila The Living: Inflation me https://www Projected Median Pro http://www.fi Udget Offf The Budge Average Pa http://www.fi Bank of F The Living:	30 Economic Series January Price Index Annual Rate of delphia ston Survey December 9, 24 edian (measured by the CPI .philadelphiafed.org/research (GDP) d Long Run Real GDP ( bjection Value From Dec 14 ederalreserve.gov/monetary ice Real GDP Economi t and Economic Outlook 20 ercentage Change From Ye cbo.gov/publication/51129	year TIPS 7 6, 2017, page 1500 Change 2019-2021 016 ) over next 10 years and-data/real-time-cente Growth , 2016 Report iolicy/fomccalendars.htm c Projections 17-2027 ar to Year 016	0.99% 2.50% Table 3 2.30% er/livingston-survey	2.07% TIPS inflation indication 2.00% 3.80% 1.80% Table C-1 pg 126 1.86%

# SUPPORT FOR YIELD CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

### **Based on Dividend Growth**

### Ke = (D1 / Po) + G

- Ke = Cost of Equity
- D1 = Expected Dividends
- Po = Current Price
- G = Sustainable Growth

Company	Ticker	Stock Price (Po)	Expected Dividend (D1)	Dividend Yield (D1/Po)	Dividend Growth (G)	Ke with Short Term Growth	Ke with Multi Stage Growth Adj
AES Corp	aes	11.620	0.61	5.25%	18.50%	23.75%	nmf
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.430	nil	nmf	nil	nmf	nmf
Dominion Resources	InD	76.590	3.02	3.94%	8.00%	11.94%	11.58%
Duke Energy	duk	77.620	3.48	4.48%	3.50%	7.98%	8.57%
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.460	0.00		N/A	N/A	N/A
El Paso Electric	ee	46.500	1.30	2.80%	7.00%	9.80%	9.49%
Entergy Corp	etr	73.470	3.50	4.76%	2.00%	6.76%	8.57%
Exelon Corp	exc	35.490	1.29	3.63%	4.00%	7.63%	nmf
NextEra Energy	nee	119.460	3.92	3.28%	9.50%	12.78%	11.78%
NRG Energy	nrg	12.260	0.28	2.28%	-2.50%	nmf	nmf
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.990	1.62	8.53%	9.00%	17.53%	nmf
Sempra Energy	sre	100.640	3.28	3.26%	7.00%	10.26%	9.15%
Southern Co	SO	50.760	2.30	4.53%	3.50%	8.03%	8.09%
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.500	0.16	2.91%	-21.50%	nmf	nmf
					Mean	11.65%	9.61%
				н	armonic Mean	10.11%	9.43%
					Median	10.03%	9.15%
					Max	23.75%	11.78%
					Min	6.76%	8.09%
					Std Dev	5.32%	1.49%
				Coefficie	nt of Variation	45.63%	15.49%
						6-14	10 00%

Say 10.00%

# SUPPORT FOR YIELD CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

### **Based on Earnings Growth**

### Ke = (D1 / Po) + G

- Ke = Cost of Equity
- D1 = Expected Dividends
- Po = Current Price
- G = Sustainable Growth

Company	Ticker	Stock Price (Po)	Expected Dividend (D1)	Dividend Yield (D1/Po)	Earnings Growth (G)	Ke with Short Term Growth	Ke with Multi Stage FCFE Adj
AES Corp	aes	11.620	0.61	5.25%	7.00%	nmf	nmf
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.430	nil	nmf	nil	nmf	nmf
Dominion Resources	D	76.590	3.02	3.94%	5.50%	9.44%	nmf
Duke Energy	duk	77.620	3.48	4.48%	5.00%	9.48%	9.54%
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.460	0.00		N/A	N/A	N/A
El Paso Electric	ee	46.500	1.30	2.80%	4.00%	6.80%	7.43%
Entergy Corp	etr	73.470	3.50	4.76%	-2.50%	nmf	nmf
Exelon Corp	exc	35.490	1.29	3.63%	5.00%	8.63%	12.37%
NextEra Energy	nee	119.460	3.92	3.28%	6.00%	9.28%	8.53%
NRG Energy	nrg	12.260	0.28	2.28%	nmf	nmf	nmf
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.990	1.62	8.53%	nmf	nmf	nmf
Sempra Energy	sre	100.640	3.28	3.26%	8.00%	11.26%	8.54%
Southern Co	S0	50.760	2.30	4.53%	4.50%	9.03%	9.26%
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.500	0.16	2.91%	22.00%	24.91%	15.01%
					Mean	11.10%	10.10%
				н	armonic Mean	9.74%	9.60%
					Median	9.36%	9.26%
					Max	24.91%	15.01%
					Min	6.80%	7.43%
					Std Dev	5.71%	2.66%
				Coefficie	nt of Variation	51.42%	26.30%
						Say	10.00%

# SUPPORT FOR YIELD CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT DIVIDEND GROWTH MODEL

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

Based on Return on Equity Ke =	(D1 / Po) + G
Ke =	Cost of Equity
D1 =	Expected Dividends
E1 =	Expected Earnings
Po =	Current Price
G =	Sustainable Growth
b =	Retained Earnings % = (1-Payout Ratio)
ROE =	Return on Equity = $(E1/Po)$

Stock Expected Expected Dividend Retained K۵ ROE Growth K۵ Dividend Company Ticker Price Earnings Yield Earnings (E1/Po)(b\*ROE) Dividends Earnings (Po) (D1) (E1) (D1/Po)(b) AES Corp 9.47% aes 11.620 0.61 1.10 5.25% nmf nmf nmf nmf Calpine Corp 11.430 nil 0.50 4.37% cpn nmf nmf nmf nmf nmf **Dominion Resources** 76.590 3.02 3.40 3.94% 4.44% 0.98% 4.92% 5.42% D 22.0% Duke Energy 77.620 3.48 4.80 1.30% duk 4.48% 21.0% 6.18% 5.78% 7.48% 8.460 0.00 0.00 Dynegy Inc dyn nmf nmf 46.500 1.30 2.45 5.27% 5.27% 7.75% El Paso Electric ee 2.80% 47.0% 2.48% Entergy Corp etr 73.470 3.50 4.85 4.76% 50.0% 6.60% 3.30% 8.06% 9.90% Exelon Corp exc 35.490 1.29 2.65 3.63% 32.0% 7.47% 2.39% 6.02% 9.86% 3.92 6.55 3.28% 5.48% 2.30% NextEra Energy nee 119.460 42.0% 5.58% 7.79% NRG Energy 12.260 0.28 0.35 2.28% 2.85% nrq nmf nmf nmf nmf Pattern Energy 1.62 0.25 8.53% 1.32% 18.990 pegi nmf nmf nmf nmf Sempra Energy 3.28 5.20 3.26% 23.0% 5.17% 1.19% 4.45% 6.36% sre 100.640 Southern Co 50.760 2.30 2.95 4.53% 19.0% 5.81% 1.10% 5.64% 6.92% so 5.500 0.16 0.50 2.91% 9.09% TransAlta Corp tac nmf nmf nmf nmf Mean 5.72% 7.68% 5.57% Harmonic Mean 7.41% Median 5.61% 7.61%

> Std Dev 1.07% 1.57% Coefficient of Variation 18.79% 20.40%

> > Say 7.50%

### SUPPORT FOR DEBT RATING AND DEBT YIELD

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

Company	Ticker	Mergent's Ratings	S&P Ratings		
AES Corp	aes	Ba3	BB		
Calpine Corp	cpn	B2	B+		
Dominion Resources	D	Baa2	BBB+		
Duke Energy	duk	Baa1	A-		
Dynegy Inc	dyn	B3	B+		
El Paso Electric	ee	Baa1	BBB		
Entergy Corp	etr	Baa3	BBB+		
Exelon Corp	exc	Baa2	BBB		
NextEra Energy	nee	Baa1	A-		
NRG Energy	nrg	B1	BB-		
Pattern Energy	pegi		BB-		
Sempra Energy	sre	Baa1	BBB+		
Southern Co	SO	Baa2	A-		
TransAlta Corp	tac		BBB-		
Overall Average De	ebt Rating	Baa3	BBB-		

Corporate	Aaa	Aa	Α	Baa
October	3.51%	3.61%	3.78%	4.38%
November	3.86%	3.94%	4.11%	4.71%
December	4.06%	4.12%	4.28%	4.83%
4th Qtr Average	3.81%	3.89%	4.06%	4.64%
<b>Public Utilities</b>	Aaa	Aa	Α	Baa
October		3.59%	3.77%	4.34%
November		3.91%	4.08%	4.64%
December		4.11%	4.27%	4.79%
4th Qtr Average		3.87%	4.04%	4.59%
Industrials	Aaa	Aa	Α	Baa
October	3.51%	3.63%	3.79%	4.40%
November	3.86%	3.97%	4.14%	4.77%
December	4.06%	4.13%	4.29%	4.85%
4th Qtr Average	3.81%	3.91%	4.07%	4.67%
			Ave YTM	Med YTM
Moody's Long Te	erm Bond Yield	Baa3	5.52%	5.52%
S&P's Long Term	n Bond Yield	BBB-	5.73%	5.78%
	Bloomberg Dec	20y	25Y	30Y
	BBB-	5.54%	5.61%	5.35%

to page 1

8

### SUPPORT FOR DIRECT CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT

2017 Assessment Year

Power Industry

	2016		20	)17	20	16	2017			
Company	Ticker	Stock Price	Actual E Ratio (E		Earning	ected gs Ratio PS/P)		ow Ratio /P)	-	ed Cash Ratio
AES Corp	aes	11.62	(1.71)	nmf	1.10	9.5%	1.85	15.9%	2.95	25.4%
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.43	0.26	2.3%	0.50	4.4%	2.10	18.4%	2.55	22.3%
Dominion Resources Inc	D	76.59	3.44	4.5%	3.40	4.4%	6.35	8.3%	6.75	8.8%
Duke Energy	duk	77.62	4.25	5.5%	4.80	6.2%	9.70	12.5%	10.60	13.7%
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.46	(5.46)	nmf	-	nmf	(0.13)	nmf	-	nmf
El Paso Electric	ee	46.50	2.30	4.9%	2.45	5.3%	5.95	12.8%	6.25	13.4%
Entergy Corp	etr	73.47	6.88	9.4%	4.85	6.6%	18.72	25.5%	17.20	23.4%
Exelon Corp	exc	35.49	1.80	5.1%	2.65	7.5%	7.85	22.1%	8.70	24.5%
NextEra Energy	nee	119.46	5.78	4.8%	6.55	5.5%	12.60	10.5%	13.55	11.3%
NRG Energy	nrg	12.26	(2.22)	nmf	0.35	2.9%	2.10	17.1%	4.20	34.3%
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.99	(0.22)	nmf	0.25	1.3%	1.80	9.5%	2.30	12.1%
Sempra Energy	sre	100.64	3.85	3.8%	5.20	5.2%	9.25	9.2%	11.00	10.9%
Southern Co	so	50.76	2.70	5.3%	2.95	5.8%	5.30	10.4%	5.85	11.5%
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.50	0.41	7.5%	0.50	9.1%	2.50	45.5%	2.65	48.2%
		Mean		5.3%		5.7%		16.7%	·	20.0%
	Harmor	nic Mean		4.7%		4.4%		13.5%		15.7%
		Median		5.0%		5.5%		12.8%		13.7%
		Max		9.4%		9.5%		45.5%		48.2%
		Min		2.3%		1.3%		8.3%		8.8%
		Std Dev		1.9%		2.3%		10.1%		11.4%
Coeffic	ient of V	/ariation		36.4%		39.9%		60.4%		57.1%
	Say			4.7%		4.4%		13.0%		14.0%

Source: Value Line / yr end stock price

### SUPPORT FOR DIRECT CAPITALIZATION EQUITY COMPONENT

2017 Assessment Year

Company	Ticker	Stock Price	Enterprise Value	EBITDA Historical	Annual Change VL	EBITDA Forecast	EV / EBITDA Forecast
AES Corp	aes	11.62	27,607,698,919	3,415,000,000	59.46%	5,445,540,541	5.07
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.43	15,420,075,963	1,749,000,000	21.43%	2,123,785,714	7.26
Dominion Resourc	εD	76.59	81,586,817,655	5,476,000,000	6.30%	5,820,944,882	14.02
Duke Energy	duk	77.62	102,636,629,295	9,221,000,000	9.28%	10,076,556,701	10.19
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.46	8,524,363,228	70,000,000			
El Paso Electric	ee	46.50	3,302,242,439	322,926,000	5.04%	339,207,983	9.74
Entergy Corp	etr	73.47	27,366,811,462	1,236,826,000	-8.12%	1,136,399,957	24.08
Exelon Corp	exc	35.49	67,579,863,444	8,688,000,000	10.83%	9,628,738,854	7.02
NextEra Energy	nee	119.46	87,442,832,532	7,685,000,000	7.54%	8,264,424,603	10.58
NRG Energy	nrg	12.26	20,752,319,055	2,034,000,000	100.00%	4,068,000,000	5.10
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.99	3,059,921,407	411,490,000	27.78%	525,792,778	5.82
Sempra Energy	sre	100.64	41,308,136,323	2,933,000,000	18.92%	3,487,891,892	11.84
Southern Co	SO	50.76	97,538,773,605	7,552,000,000	10.38%	8,335,698,113	11.70
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.50	6,290,275,533	1,142,000,000	6.00%	1,210,520,000	5.20
14		Mean					9.82
		Harmonic Mean					8.04
		Median					9.74
		Std Dev					5.21
Source:		Say					6.00

Value Line & Morning Star

### DATA INPUT

Washington State Department of Revenue

2017 Assessment Year

### Power Industry

Instructions: Data entered on this page will flow to the applicable worksheets.

Guideline Companies		Stock Price	Beta Levered	Financial Strength	Revenues	Cash Flow	Earnings	Dividends	Bk Value	Common	LTD (BV)
Name	Ticker	Yahoo	VL	VL	Per Share	Per Share	Per Share	Per Share	Stock	Shares	VL
AES Corp	aes	11.62	1.15	В	20.61	1.85	(1.71)	0.56	4.24	659,182,351	19,160,000,000
Calpine Corp	cpn	11.43	1.00	B+	18.71	2.10	0.26		9.10	359,061,764	11,431,000,000
Dominion Resources Inc	D	76.59	0.70	B++	18.70	6.35	3.44	2.80	23.30	626,750,459	28,707,000,000
Duke Energy	duk	77.62	0.60	А	34.10	9.70	4.25	3.36	58.70	688,941,372	43,964,000,000
Dynegy Inc	dyn	8.46	1.40	C+	36.81	(0.13)	(5.46)		14.00	117,300,618	8,778,000,000
El Paso Electric	ee	46.50	0.70	B++	21.70	5.95	2.30	1.23	26.15	40,522,246	1,195,400,000
Entergy Corp	etr	73.47	0.65	B++	60.55	18.72	6.88	3.42	45.12	179,394,698	14,492,000,000
Exelon Corp	exc	35.49	0.70	B++	33.90	7.85	1.80	1.26	27.90	923,270,314	32,972,000,000
NextEra Energy	nee	119.46	0.65	А	33.50	12.60	5.78	3.48	50.50	467,267,977	28,195,000,000
NRG Energy	nrg	12.26	1.25	B+	39.15	2.10	(2.22)	0.24	14.10	315,442,011	18,006,000,000
Pattern Energy	pegi	18.99	1.25	B+	4.05	1.80	(0.22)	1.56	11.30	87,410,290	1,335,000,000
Sempra Energy	sre	100.64	0.80	А	39.85	9.25	3.85	3.02	49.40	250,060,973	13,522,000,000
Southern Co	so	50.76	0.55	А	19.35	5.30	2.70	2.22	28.60	979,999,480	41,550,000,000
TransAlta Corp	tac	5.50	0.85	C++	8.32	2.50	0.41	0.16	8.35	288,231,915	3,722,000,000

Average

Harmonic Mean

Median

Value Line Jan-Mar 2017